Facile synthesis of cobalt/nickel tungstate and its application in hybrid supercapacitor

Meigui Feng, Dongxia An, Hong Zhang, Gang Ma, Cuimiao Zhang and Zhiguang Ma

Abstract
In this paper, cobalt/nickel tungstate materials (CoWO₄@NiWO₄-A) have been synthesized by coprecipitation in alkaline condition, and the electrochemical behaviors of the samples were investigated. The as-prepared composites have been systematically characterized by powder X-ray diffraction, scanning electron microscopy, and Brunauer-Emmett-Teller analysis. The pseudocapacitive performances of composite electrode materials were investigated by the electrochemical tests. The CoWO₄@NiWO₄-A showed good electrochemical performances. In addition, a hybrid supercapacitor (HSC) was assembled by using the CoWO₄@NiWO₄-A as the positive electrode and activated carbon (AC) as negative electrode. The HSC exhibited an energy density of 11.96 Wh/kg at a power density of 1090 W/kg. In addition, the HSC displayed good cyclic stability after 5000 continuous charge-discharge tests. Therefore, this work provides a candidate electrode materials for supercapacitors.

Keywords: Supercapacitors, electrode material, co-precipitation, cobalt/nickel tungstates

1. Introduction
In the twenty-first century, mankind faced enormous challenges in energy crisis and environmental protection. Due to the use of coal and fossil fuel, the pollution is getting worse and the fossil fuels are drying up. Therefore, scientists are devoted to the invention of new renewable energy storage devices. Supercapacitors, also known as electrochemical capacitors (ECs) have features of high energy density and power density, fast charge-discharge rate, excellent cycle stability and environmental safety [1-3]. Hence, the ECs have many applications in electronics, national defense, communication, vehicle, aviation and so on. Supercapacitors are classified into two groups by the energy storage theory: (i) electrochemical double layer capacitors (EDLCs), which store energy by the double layer of electrode-electrolyte interface [4]. Various carbon-based materials have been used as the electrode materials of the EDLCs due to large specific area, abundant pore structure and favorable conductivity [5]; (ii) Faradic pseudocapacitors, based on the rapid Faradic redox reaction of the electrode materials [3], such as metal oxides/hydroxides [6] and conducting polymers [7].

At present, many researchers are developing various novel electro-active materials with low cost, high electrochemical properties and environmental safety [6]. Transition metal oxides and other composites have been widely applied in electrode materials of pseudocapacitors owing to their diverse oxidation states, good conductivity and high capacitance. These materials include the oxides of Ru [8], Ni [9], Co [10], V [11], Fe [12], and so on. In addition, transition metal tungstate composites not only have been used for luminescent materials, pigments, catalysts, and sensors, but also have been applied in electrochemistry for storage devices. Recently, more researchers are devoted to study the electrochemical performances of metal tungstate compounds, such as 3D nanoporous ZnWO₄ [13], NiCo₂O₄@NiWO₄ [14], CoWO₄ [15], FeWO₄ [16], RGO/CoWO₄ [17], NiWO₄/reduced graphene oxide [18], CoO₄@CoWO₄/rGO [19], and so on. It indicated that metal tungstate composites are promising candidates of electro-active materials. In this article, we prepared cobalt and nickel tungstate composites (CoWO₄, NiWO₄, CoWO₄@NiWO₄ and CoWO₄@NiWO₄-A) by a facile chemical co-precipitation method, and their electrochemical performances were compared by the cyclic voltammetry (CV), galvanostatic charge-discharge (GCD) and electrochemical impedance spectroscopy (EIS). It is found that CoWO₄@NiWO₄-A as an electrode material has better electrochemical performance. In addition, a hybrid supercapacitor CoWO₄@NiWO₄-A//AC was assembled successfully and its electrochemical performances were evaluated.
2. Experimental
2.1 Synthesis of CoWO₄@NiWO₄-A
All reagents in the experiment were of analytical grade and directly used without any purification. CoWO₄@NiWO₄-A powders were prepared by carrying out the reaction between NaWO₄·2H₂O and sulfates in a flask under magnetic stirring. In a typical synthesis, first, 2.5 mmol sulfates (NiSO₄·6H₂O: CoSO₄·7H₂O = 3:1, molar ratio) were dissolved in 25 mL ultrapure water under magnetic stirring and further stirred for about 30 min at room temperature (solution A). Next, 1.25 mmol Na₂WO₄·2H₂O and 1.25 mmol NaOH were dissolved in 25 mL ultrapure water under magnetic stirring (solution B). Finally, the solution B was added dropwise into the solution A under magnetic stirring, and then the resulting suspension was further stirred for 3h. The obtained precipitate was separated by centrifugation, washed with abundant ultrapure water and ethanol for several times, and dried at 60 °C in vacuum for 12 h.

For comparison, CoWO₄, NiWO₄ and CoWO₄@NiWO₄ prepared through a similar route as for CoWO₄@NiWO₄-A. For CoWO₄@NiWO₄, a solution B was added dropwise into a solution A under stirring, except that NaOH was not used in solution B, and the amount of substance of WO₄²⁻ in the solution B is 2.5 mmol. For the CoWO₄ and NiWO₄, the solution containing 2.5 mmol Na₂WO₄·2H₂O was added dropwise into the solution containing equimolar of CoSO₄·7H₂O under stirring, and the NiWO₄ prepared through a similar route as for CoWO₄. The similar processes were repeated to get CoWO₄, NiWO₄ and CoWO₄@NiWO₄ powders.

2.2 Materials characterization
The morphologies of the as-prepared products were observed by field emission scanning electron microscope (SEM, JSM-7500F). The crystal structures and compositions of the as-prepared samples were characterized by X-ray powder diffraction (XRD, Bruker D8 Advance). N₂ absorption-desorption were performed with a Micromeritics Tristar II 3020. The surface area was computed from the Brunauer–Emmett–Teller (BET) equation, and the pore size distribution was calculated from the desorption curve by the Barret–Joyner–Halenda (BJH) model.

2.3 Electrochemical measurements
The electrochemical measurements were investigated on an electrochemical workstation (Interface 1000, Gamry Instruments, USA) using a three-electrode system. The reference electrode was a saturated calomel electrode (SCE), and the counter electrode was a platinum plate. The working electrodes were prepared as follows: the as-prepared electroactive materials, acetylene black and polytetrafluoroethylene (PTFE) concentrated dispersion (10 wt.%) were mixed together in a mass ratio of 80:15:5 with absolute ethanol to form homogeneous mixture slurry. The slurry coated on the pre-cleaned nickel foam support (1 cm x 1 cm) and then dried at 60 °C in vacuum for 12 h. Finally, the prepared electrode was pressed at 10 MPa. The AC electrode was fabricated in the same way. The mass loading of active materials for the electrode is about 3 mg.

The electrochemical tests were carried out using 1 M KOH aqueous solution as the electrolyte. The electrochemical performances of the prepared electrodes were tested by CV, GCD and EIS measurements. The EIS measurements were carried out in the frequency range of 100 kHz to 0.01 Hz at the open circuit potentials, and the applied potential amplitude was 5 mV. The corresponding specific capacitance (C) was calculated from the following equations:

\[ C = \frac{I\Delta t}{m\Delta V} \]  

where C is the specific capacitance (F/g), I is the discharge current (A), \( \Delta t \) is the discharge time (s), \( \Delta V \) is the potential window (V), m is the mass of electro-active materials in the electrodes (g).

3. Results and discussion
3.1 The structural and morphological characterization of samples
Fig 1 shows the XRD patterns of the as-prepared samples. Evidently, the powders of samples were amorphous without any crystallized phases. In other words, the broad diffraction peaks with low intensity should result from the amorphous state and/or nanometer-scale size of the as-prepared samples [20]. This phenomenon is corresponding to previous reports on CoWO₄-NiWO₄, CoWO₄-NiWO₄ [20-22]. In addition, there is no peak from Co(OH)₂ and Ni(OH)₂ in the patterns, which is attributed to slight Co(OH)₂ and Ni(OH)₂ in the samples.

![Fig 1: XRD patterns of the metal tungstates.](image)

Fig 2. Displays FT-IR spectrum for the fabricated (CoWO₄, NiWO₄, CoWO₄@NiWO₄, CoWO₄@NiWO₄-A) powders recorded within 400-400 cm⁻¹ range. The absorption bands at about 3400 cm⁻¹ and 1630 cm⁻¹ refer to –OH stretching and bending vibration of the water absorption. The characteristic stretching absorption bands of metal tungstate range from 950 cm⁻¹ to 400 cm⁻¹ [23]. It is obviously that the weak absorption bands with the maxima at 835-850 cm⁻¹ can be contributed to the stretching mode of W-O bonds in the joints with WO₄ tetrahedral [24]. The bands at about 930 cm⁻¹ corresponds to the stretching mode of the W=O bond [25]. The weak bands at 680 cm⁻¹ is caused by the asymmetric stretching vibration of O-W-O bridges [15]. All of results further confirm that the synthesized amorphous materials are tungstate composites.

![Fig 2: FT-IR spectra of CoWO₄, NiWO₄, CoWO₄@NiWO₄ and CoWO₄@NiWO₄-A.](image)
The morphology characters of CoWO₄, NiWO₄, CoWO₄@NiWO₄ and CoWO₄@NiWO₄-A are shown in Fig 3a-d. The images were got under the same magnification. As observed from SEM images (Fig 3a-d), the as-prepared samples are made up of wafer-like architecture, and the particles are randomly assembled and aggregated together. In addition, the particle size of CoWO₄@NiWO₄ was smaller than other as-prepared samples, indicating the sample possesses higher specific area. The smaller size can shorten the path length of ion transfer and drastically enhance the charge-discharge rate [20].

The surface area and pore structure of CoWO₄@NiWO₄ and CoWO₄@NiWO₄-A were measured by the nitrogen adsorption and desorption experiments as shown in Fig 4. The samples show a typical IV isotherm profile with distinct hysteresis loops. The Brunauer-Emmett-Teller (BET) specific surface area for CoWO₄@NiWO₄ and CoWO₄@NiWO₄-A materials are 6.97, 72.62 m²/g, with the total pore volume of 0.02, 0.19 cm³/g, respectively. The surface area of the CoWO₄@NiWO₄-A is higher than that of the CoWO₄@NiWO₄. Hence, CoWO₄@NiWO₄-A exhibits the larger electro-active surface area and higher electrochemical performances. The CoWO₄@NiWO₄ and CoWO₄@NiWO₄-A exhibit mesoporous structure with average pore size of 10.1 nm and 9.1 nm, respectively. The mesoporous structures are approachable to electrolyte ions and facilitate the charge accumulation and fast charge transfer, resulting in the improved specific capacitance and rate capability [27].

### 3.2 Electrochemical characterization

#### 3.2.1 Electrochemical performances of samples

Fig 5. Depicts the CV curves of the CoWO₄, NiWO₄, CoWO₄@NiWO₄ and CoWO₄@NiWO₄-A under the same scanning rate (5 mV/s) in the potential range from 0 to 0.55 V. As we have seen, CV curve of each sample exhibits a pair of redox peaks, indicating typical pseudocapacitive properties. The observed redox peaks are owing to the charge-transfer kinetics of Co³⁺/Co²⁺ and Ni²⁺/Ni³⁺ in the metal tungstates. The electrochemical reactions are as follows [20]:

\[
\text{Co(OH)}_2 + \text{OH}^- \rightleftharpoons \text{CoOOH} + \text{H}_2\text{O} + \text{e}^- \quad (2)
\]

\[
\text{Ni(OH)}_2 + \text{OH}^- \rightleftharpoons \text{NiOOH} + \text{H}_2\text{O} + \text{e}^- \quad (3)
\]

![Image of CV curves](image)

It is found that integral area of CoWO₄@NiWO₄-A is ultimate, which maybe indicates its higher specific capacitances. Fig 6. Shows the CV curves of CoWO₄@NiWO₄-A at various scan rates. Obviously, all the curves exhibit a pair of strong redox peaks in the range of 0.1-0.2 V and 0.3-0.4 V, indicating typical faradic pseudocapacitive behavior, which is ascribed to the quasi-reversible reaction between Ni²⁺/Ni³⁺ and Co³⁺/Co²⁺ [20]. The redox peaks of CV curves become wider with the increasing scan rates from 5 to 50 mV/s, and the anodic peak potential shifts positively, meanwhile, the cathodic peak potential shifts negatively [20]. Nonetheless, the CV curves still display a pair of redox shape at a sweep rate of 50 mV/s, suggesting that tungstates electrodes were beneficial to fast redox reactions.

![Image of CV curves at various scan rates](image)

In order to further investigate the specific capacitance, GCD tests were carrying out in 1M KOH within a potential range from 0 to 0.48 V. Fig 7. Presents the charge-discharge curves of as-prepared samples at a current density of 1 A/g. The CoWO₄@NiWO₄-A exhibits a specific capacitance as high as 677.5 F/g for the first discharge, and the specific capacitances calculated from Eq. (1) for CoWO₄, NiWO₄ and
CoWO₄@NiWO₄ are 36.2, 433.3 and 493.1 F/g, respectively. Obviously, CoWO₄@NiWO₄-A has the highest specific capacitance, which is owing to the fast intercalation/de-intercalation of electrolyte ions via active sites of electrode material and the generation of slight Co₀.₇₅Ni₀.₇₅(OH)₂. It exhibited that the composites have better electrochemical properties in alkaline. Fig 8. exhibits the galvanostatic charge-discharge curves of CoWO₄@NiWO₄-A electrode within a potential range from 0 to 0.48 V at different current densities. According to the Eq. (1), the specific capacitance for the first discharge of CoWO₄@NiWO₄-A are calculated to be 677.5, 641.7, 622.3, 593.8, 548 and 515 F/g at current densities of 1, 2, 3, 5, 8 and 10 A/g, respectively. The good rate capability is ascribed to the good conductivity of the electrode material and small charge transfer resistance.

$$C = \frac{I \times \Delta t}{\Delta V}$$

Fig 7: Galvanostatic charge-discharge curves of as-prepared electrodes at a current density of 1 A/g.

Fig 8: Charge-discharge curves of the CoWO₄@NiWO₄-A electrode at different current densities.

Fig 9: Specific capacitance of the as-prepared electrodes at different current densities.

Fig 10: Cycling stability of the as-prepared electrodes at 5 A/g.

In order to further investigate the performance and impedance of the electrode materials, EIS measurements were performed. Fig 11. displays the typical Nyquist plots of CoWO₄, NiWO₄, CoWO₄@NiWO₄ and CoWO₄@NiWO₄-A compounds. The corresponding equivalent circuit model that applied to fit the EIS data is given in the inset of Fig 11. All the Nyquist plots are similar, being made up of a semicircle at the high-frequency region, a linear section at the low-frequency region and a transition zone between two regions. At the high-frequency region, the semicircle diameter of Nyquist plot corresponds to the interfacial charge-transfer resistance (Rct) occurring at the electrode/electrolyte interface and double layer capacitance, which is mainly associated with the Faradaic reactions. The internal resistance (Ri) obtained from the intercept of the plots on the real axis, which mainly includes ion impedance of electrolyte, intrinsic impedance of the electrode materials and contact resistance between active materials and current collectors [21]. In the low-frequency region, the almost straight line of the slope of 45° is referred to as the Warburg resistance (W), which corresponding to the ion diffusion in the host material diffusive resistance of the electrolyte in the electrode surface [33]. The measured impedance spectra of samples were further analyzed based on the equivalent circuit. The constant phase angle element \(\Phi_1\) and \(\Phi_2\) represent non-ideal capacitive behavior [34]. The fitted values are listed in Table 1. As shown in the Table 1, the Rct of CoWO₄@NiWO₄-A electrode material is lower than pure
NiWO₄ and CoWO₄@NiWO₄ compound, indicating that CoWO₄@NiWO₄-A has faster charge-transfer, which can enhance the electrochemical properties of the electrode material. It is corresponding to the results of the previous CV and GCD.

![Fig 11: Nyquist plots of the as-prepared electrodes. The inset shows the electrical equivalent circuit used for fitting impedance spectra.](image)

Table 1: The fitted values of $R_\text{ct}$ and $R_\text{s}$ of as-prepared electrodes based on the equivalent circuit.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Material</th>
<th>$R_\text{s}$ (Ω)</th>
<th>$R_\text{ct}$ (Ω)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CoWO₄</td>
<td>3.855</td>
<td>0.835</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NiWO₄</td>
<td>2.159</td>
<td>6.243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CoWO₄@NiWO₄-A</td>
<td>2.131</td>
<td>2.525</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CoWO₄@NiWO₄-A</td>
<td>2.309</td>
<td>1.108</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3.2.2 Electrochemical property of the hybrid supercapacitor

The CoWO₄@NiWO₄-A//AC aqueous hybrid supercapacitor was fabricated by using of CoWO₄@NiWO₄-A and AC as positive and negative electrodes, respectively. As for a capacitor, the charge balance between two electrodes follows the relationship according to equation [35]:

$$ C_m \Delta V = C_p \Delta V $$

(4)

Where $C$ (F/g) is the specific capacitance, $m$ (g) is the mass of the active material in the electrode, $\Delta V$ (V) is the voltage window. On the basis of the charge-discharge test, the specific capacitance of CoWO₄@NiWO₄-A and AC electrode is 677.5 and 146 F/g at a discharge current density of 1 A/g. According to the Eq. (4), the optimal mass ratio of the active materials expected to be $m$ (AC)/$m$[CoWO₄@NiWO₄-A] = 2.2 in the hybrid capacitor. In this article, the weight of active materials of positive and negative electrode is 2.4 mg and 5.3 mg, respectively. Electrochemical performance of the HSC was characterized by CV and GCD measurements.

![Fig 12: CV curves of CoWO₄@NiWO₄-A and activated carbon (AC) electrodes at a scan rate of 5 mV/s.](image)

![Fig 13: CV curves of the hybrid supercapacitor CoWO₄@NiWO₄-A//AC at various scan rates.](image)

![Fig 14: Galvanostatic charge-discharge curves of CoWO₄@NiWO₄-A//AC with a potential of 1.48 V at various current densities.](image)

GCD curves of HSC at different current densities are shown in Fig 14. The specific capacitance of HSC was calculated from GCD curves according to Eq. (1). It should be noted that $m$ (g) means the total mass of the active material in the positive and negative electrodes. The calculated specific capacitance values are 26.60, 22.26, 19.61, 17.59, 15.99, 12.51 and 10.76 F/g at current densities of 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 8 and 10 A/g, respectively. In addition, the energy densities and power densities of the Ragone plot is a key curve to characterize the performance of electrochemical supercapacitors. The corresponding relationship between energy densities (E, Wh/kg) and power densities (P, W/kg) of the HSC can be calculated from the following equations [36]:

$$ E = \frac{\int \Delta V \, dt}{m} $$

(5)

$$ P = \frac{E}{\Delta t} $$

(6)
Where \( I \) (A) is the discharge current, \( V \) (V) is the potential range during galvanostatic discharge process, \( \Delta t \) (s) is the discharge time and \( m \) (g) is the total mass of active material of electrodes. The Ragone plot showing the relationship between energy densities and power densities of the asymmetric device is shown in Fig 15. The maximum energy density of the HSC was recorded as 11.96 Wh/kg with a corresponding power density of 1.09 kW/kg. In addition, the device maintains 3.97 Wh/kg with a high power density of 8.97 kW/kg. Some previous reported supercapacitors based on tungstates were fabricated and tested. For instance, Ma et al. assembled the CBC-1//K\(_6\)W\(_{18}\)O\(_{49}\) ASC, which exhibited an energy density of 26.3Wh/kg corresponding power density of 404.2 W/kg \(^{37}\). Wang et al. prepared the NiWO\(_4@\)CoWO\(_4//\)AC hybrid supercapacitor, which showed an energy density of 30.1 Wh/kg at a power density of 200 W/kg \(^{21}\). The inset of Fig 15 shows the HSC can light a lamp for about 15 seconds.

Fig 15: Ragone plot of the CoWO\(_4@\)NiWO\(_4\)-A//AC, the inset shows the application of the hybrid supercapacitor.

Fig 16. Exhibits the cycling stability and coulombic efficiency of CoWO\(_4@\)NiWO\(_4\)-A//AC within the potential range of 0-1.48 V at the current density of 5 A/g. The HSC exhibits better cyclic stability with 82% of the initial capacitance after 5000 continuous galvanostatic charge-discharge cycling experiments. In addition, the coulombic efficiency maintains about 79% during first few cycles, while it maintains 100% during next cyclic experiments, which is ascribed to activation of electrode materials. The cycling performance of HSC indicates that it has good electrochemical stability.

4. Conclusion

In summary, we have presented a facile approach to prepare the metal tungstate (CoWO\(_4@\)NiWO\(_4\)-A) by chemical co-precipitation method. The CoWO\(_4@\)NiWO\(_4\)-A electrode shows good electrochemical performance, with a high specific capacitance of 677.5 F/g at 1 A/g and desirable cyclic stability. For its practical application, a hybrid supercapacitor CoWO\(_4@\)NiWO\(_4\)-A//AC was assembled, the electrochemical performance of the device was investigated within a potential range of 0-1.48 V and exhibits good capacitance property. The HSC shows better cycling stability with 82% capacitance retention over 5000 cycles at 5 A/g. All above results demonstrated that metal tungstate materials could be considered as promising electrode materials for pseudocapacitors in energy storage systems.

Acknowledgements

We gratefully thank the financial support from Program for National Natural Science Foundation of China (51302062).

References